Pakistan Journal of Criminology Vol. 11, Issue 02, April 2019 (33-50)

Psycho-Socio-Cultural and Personal Attributes of Murderers in Punjab, Pakistan

Adnan Adil¹ & Qurratulain²

Abstract

Murderers have specific behaviors inclusive of developmental, psychological, and cognitive characteristics. The present research is based on a purposive sample (N = 170) of convicted murderers in district jails of Sargodha, Shahpur, and Jehlum. The thematic analysis of the data obtained through semi-structured interviews depicted that a typical murderer was a young, poor, unskilled, and uneducated man with no history of imprisonment. The major themes in the domain of developmental trajectories included unstable family and poor interpersonal relationships. The major sub-themes in the cognitive factors included lack of empathy, lack of remorse or guilt, and lack of self-control. Antisocial tendencies and impaired psychological health were the major themes extracted in the domain of psychological characteristics. The major causes of committing the murder were revenge/enmity, honor killing (Zan), robbery, sudden provocations, and disputes over the land/property (Zar and Zameen). Murderers' emotional states before and after killing were the function of the motives of killing.

Keywords: psycho-developmental characteristics of the murderers, reasons for murder, cognitive and emotional states of the murderers

Introduction

In Pakistan, the empirical literature on the profile of the murderers is quite scarce. Earlier studies on murderers conducted in Pakistan derived conclusions based on old records and the sample of these studies did not exclusively comprise of the murderers (Suhail & Javed, 2004). Therefore, conclusions drawn about murderers were based on a limited number of cases or a small sample size. Furthermore, we could only identify a couple of studies on the samples of convicted murderers and both studies were quite limited in their scope as both were focused on the causes of committing the murder. For instance, an interview-based study with a sample of 100

¹ Assistant Professor, Department of Psychology, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan. <u>livespirit786@yahoo.com</u>

² Department of Psychology, University of Sargodha, Sargodha, Pakistan. <u>qurratulain.zahra487@gmail.com</u>

convicted murderers by Suhail and Javed found that majority of the murderers were young, belonged to lower socioeconomic class, were illiterate, and unskilled. Abrupt provocation, old disputes over property, lust in terms of land, property, and women, and enmities were found to be the major causes of the murders. Similar findings have been reported in a case study of 26 convicted murderers by Hashmi, Hassan, Hassan, and Akram (2000).

The present research has a much broader perspective than those of the studies because it aimed at the exploration of the developmental, cognitive, and psychological characteristics or attributes of the convicted murderers besides examining the major causes of committing the murder. Furthermore, this study has employed a relatively bigger sample of the convicted murderers, owing to which our findings might have a greater potential for generalization. The following section provides a brief literature review on the developmental and psychological characteristics of criminals including murderers.

Literature Review

There are several developmental, cognitive, and psychological attributes that may differentiate between the criminals/murderers and non-criminals. The reasons for murder may include gain, revenge and enmity, sectarianism, and sudden provocation (Hashmi et al., 2000). Other important factors contributing to criminal behaviors are high unemployment, poverty, poor education, faulty parenting, overpopulation, and group values. In the developmental framework, the lack of parental supervision has been observed as a strong predictor of serious violent delinquency. Criminologists assume that bad parenting is a source of youthful delinquency (Collins, Maccoby, Steinberg, Hetherington, & Bornstein, 2000).

Insecure attachment can be considered as one factor that may develop offending behaviors. Levinson and Fonagy (2004) argued that offenders were liable to be dismissing in their attachment style as compared to non-offenders. They also argued that offenders were unable to understand others' perspectives and this, in turn, restricted their potential to empathize that makes them more liable to offend.

In the context of psychological factors, the absence of unconditional positive approval and low self-regard may provoke anger that may culminate in criminal acts. Hostility and aggression arise from the individuals' attempts to secure themselves from feelings of inferiority and shame by externalizing blame for their failures. In turn, these feelings of hostility and anger develop criminal behavior. Skodol, Johnson, Cohen, Sneed, and Crawford (2007) found that negative personality characteristics or personality disorders combined together, foster a higher order antisocial factor related with a history of violent and non-violent criminal offending.

In terms of cognitive factors, impaired self-control and lack of empathy are the hallmark characteristics of the criminals. In Pakistan, the results of a study by Akram, Abbasi, and Mahmood (2014) indicated that convicted youth had a low level of self-control and still inclined towards aggressive and risky behaviors. The finding of a study on low self-control and crime in late adulthood generally support the notion that low self-control theory partially explains offending in late adulthood (Wolfe, Reisige, & Holtfreter, 2015).

Antisocial actions are committed by people with low self-control (Roberts, 2008). Higher levels of impulsivity have been observed among delinquents and these higher levels are related to increased official measures of offending, self-reported criminal activities, and childhood behavioral problems (Siegel, 2008). In short, self-control theorist asserts that incoherent environment fosters volatile pleasure from momentary irritations. Inappropriate nurturance, discipline and training, and parental supervision foster all the attributes of low self-control (Gottfredson & Hirschi, 1995). Apparently, people become criminal because they are poor at regulating their antisocial impulses and hence violate many of society's formal (and informal) rules.

Method

The present study employed a qualitative research design whereby data were collected through semi-structured interviews and were analyzed through thematic analysis.

Sample

A purposive sample of (N = 170) convicted men who had been sentenced to death and life imprisonment were taken from District Jail Sargodha (n = 180), Jhelum (n = 65), and Shahpur (n = 107), Pakistan. The demographic characteristics of the sample are depicted in Figure 1.



Figure 1. Demographic characteristics of the sample

Instrument

A structured interview protocol was developed for the data collection of the present study through the following steps:

Item pool generation. In addition to the previous pertinent literature, two criminal lawyers and one jail superintendent were consulted in order to get a general idea about respondents' characteristics. Finally, keeping in mind the information obtained from these resources, 100 open-ended items were generated. These questions were about the developmental histories, psychological factors leading to offensive behavior, and cognitive characteristics of the offenders.

Expert opinion. The experts included two teachers of the Department of Psychology, University of Sargodha, a criminal lawyer, and a jail superintendent of district jail, Sargodha. The purpose of taking expert opinion was to ensure the relevance and applicability of interview guideline on the target population.

Committee approach for final interview schedule. A committee comprising of four faculty members of the Department of Psychology, the University of Sargodha (two PhDs and two M.Phils.) were consulted for the finalization of the interview schedule. The participants were given the initial interview schedule for scrutiny and after a week, it was collected from the committee members. Afterward, a discussion session of about two hours was held and the unanimously recommended 57 items were retained in the final interview schedule. The items in the interview schedule asked about the potential life antecedents and consequences of committing murder.

Procedure

After securing the official permission from the superintendent jails, respondents were interviewed individually by a team of three researchers in the investigation room of the jails. Informed consents were taken and rapport was developed before conducting interviews. The interview protocol was used as a guide. Since we were not allowed to record the interview through any electronic device, therefore, the note-taking method was used for recording the data. The notes taken by the two researchers were compared and all data were transcribed immediately after the interview.

Results

Thematic Analysis

Thematic analysis was used to evolve, recognize, and report themes within the transcribed data because it explained latent meaning instead of the semantic meaning

of the respondent's responses. Braun and Clarke's (2006) six-step procedure of carrying out thematic analysis was adopted in the current study.



Figure 2. Schematic presentation of Braun and Clarke's (2006) method of thematic analysis

Data familiarization. During the data collection stage, proper attention was paid to the responses of respondents. Over the series of interviews, familiarization was gained. Actively written notes were taken during the interview. On average, each transcript was read five times. After gaining familiarization with data, initial codes were generated.

Initial coding and themes. Initial codes were generated using data led approach. This approach is dominated by the characteristics of the data and coding is primarily guided by a careful analysis of what is happening in data. Following codes were initially generated:

General family environment. General family environment included the family structure and the instant members (e.g., parents and their children's) of the family as well as interpersonal relations of individuals. Keeping in mind the definition of a family environment, codes of family violence, disrupted families, the interpersonal relationship of the parents, and interference from the in-laws were combined under the theme of general family environment.

Parenting and parental practices. Parenting referred to the process of nurturing and sustaining individual emotional, physical, and psychological needs from infancy to adulthood. The codes of parental bereavement, parental control, mothers'

interference, discipline strategies, and temperament of the parents were combined under the theme of parenting and parental practices.

Participant's behaviors toward family members. Participant's behaviors towards family included the nature of the interaction between siblings and other family members. These behaviors encompassed the kind of reaction an individual showed when interacting with their family members. These patterns were categorized under behaviors towards family members on the basis of the participant's reports. According to their comments, they often used to irritate their family members by smashing their things. They often quarreled and argued with their family members on minor issues. Once they asked for something, they wanted it on the spot by fair and foul means.

Classroom and school behaviors. Classroom and school behaviors involved the nature of interaction with teachers and classmates. In the current study, participants reported that they often quarreled with their classmates without any reasons. During class discussion, they irritated their teachers for the sake of enjoyment. They reported that teachers often used coercive treatment in order to discipline them.

Delinquent patterns. Delinquent patterns referred to the failure to pay obligation; these patterns included immoral or illegal acts committed particularly by young people. In the current study, participants' patterns of stealing habits, drug use, and involvement with the delinquent groups are classified in the theme of delinquent patterns.

Lack of empathy. Empathic people had a good understanding of others emotions, thoughts, and viewpoints. In the current study, cruelty toward animals, instant gratification, and revenge tendencies were classified as non-empathic behaviors because lack of social and emotional skills perpetrated animal abuse or cruelty towards animals and lack of empathy is also a proximal predictor of desires for taking revenge (Bernhardt & Singer, 2012).

Aggression. Aggression is described as any behavior directed towards another individual, carried out with the intent to cause harm. In the current study, physical and verbal aggressive behaviors and self-harming behaviors were classified into aggression.

Personal and marital relations. Personal relations are described as a close connection between people formed by emotional bond and interaction. These bonds often grow from and are often strengthened by mutual experiences. The present study incorporated the codes of love affairs, marital and extramarital relations, emotional attachment, intimacy, and interaction; into personal and marital relations.

Causes of murder. Murder is described as the illegal and irrational killing of one person by another. Respondents in this study reported following causes of murder: revenge, honor killing, harsh conversation, financial and domestic issues, a dispute over land or property, jealousy/envy, and the murder committed during the attempt of robbery.

The weapon used for killing. In the current study, the majority of murders were committed using firearms, in a few cases weapons like axes and daggers were used. Only one person reported the injection of poison for committing murder.

Emotional states before and after committing murder. Emotional states were the feelings that resulted in physical or psychological changes in individual behavior. In the current study, individuals aimed at taking revenge reported that they were happy, excited, calm, and contented because their desire of taking revenge was being fulfilled. Honor killers reported that they were in the state of extreme aggression and felt shocked, fear, and contentment after the murder.

Participants committing murder during quarrel reported emotional states of extreme anger and impulsivity before the murder and felt afraid, shocked, and grieved after the murder. Participants in categories of sudden provocation and robbery also reported a feeling of aggression and fear. Participants committing murder due to financial and domestic issues said that they were upset, irritated, and annoyed just before committing murder and felt extreme sadness, depression, and loneliness after committing the murder.

Crime history. Crime history referred to the involvement of participant in any other crime and imprisonment history for a crime other than the murder. Majority of the respondents reported that they were not involved in any other crime. A few reported being involved in gambling, drugs, and kidnapping. None of the participants had any imprisonment history.

Psychological issues. Psychological issues are described in terms of behavioral patterns, mental, and emotional states. In the current study, codes of disturbed sleep, altered mental states (hallucinations), and flashbacks of the crime scene or the victim were grouped under the theme of psychological issues.

Immoral patterns of behavior. Immoral behaviors involved lack of remorse or guilt on wrong acts. Present data reflected that murderers had a poor moral obligation. They did not have feelings of guilt or remorse on their heinous acts. Instead, they had the tendency to obviously blame others and society for their criminal acts.

Familial support and behaviors. Familial support is described as the integrated network of community-based resources and services provided by family

members of an offender. In the current study, the majority of murderers' families appreciated their act; they felt pride in their acts. Majority of participants reported that their siblings, parent, or cousins supported and helped them in committing the murder. Participants claimed that their families were supporting them financially as well as legally.

Review of themes. In this section, the initial themes into which the initial codes were grouped were reviewed for the possible overlapping. This was done in order to organize all of the evidence together in support of the theme. In this process, the general family environment and parenting and parental practices were merged into a new theme labeled as the family instability. Delinquent patterns, non-empathic behaviors, aggression, and irritating behaviors at school were combined into a new theme labeled as antisocial behaviors.

Table 1

Main Themes	Sub Themes	f	%
Family instability		102	60%
	General Family Environment	101	59%
	Parenting and parental practices	97	57%
Interpersonal		133	78%
relations			
	Participants behaviors towards	94	55%
	family members		
	Love affairs and friendship	113	66%
Anti-social behaviors		117	68%
	Delinquent patterns of behaviors	103	60%
	Non-empathic behaviors	110	64%
	Aggressive Behaviors	102	69
	Classroom & school behaviors	60	35%
Intimate relations	Married participants	93	54%
	Marital Satisfaction	36	38%
	Extra marital Relations	39	41%
Reasons for murder			
	Revenge, personal enmity, and old	40	23%

Frequency and Percentage of Themes and Subthemes Generated from the Current Data

	····		
	enmity	22	120/
	Disputes over land and property		12%
	Honor killing	22	12%
	During Robbery	9	5%
	Sudden provocation and harsh conversation	32	18%
	Financial and domestic issues and	6	9%
	envy		
	Not confessed	37	21%
Emotional states			
before committing			
murder			
	Aggressive	50	29
	Scared, insulting, hateful	11	6%
	Intense Grief	35	20%
	Happiness and excitement	4	2%
	Irritated, upset, annoyed	4	2%
	Contended	27	15%
	Jealousy	2	1%
	No Feelings	37	21%
Emotional states after			
committing murder			
	Feared, anxious, terrified,	57	33%
	loneliness, shocked		
	Excited, in pride	37	21%
	Calm and contended, satisfied	37	21%
	Sorrow or grief	2	21%
Crime history	6	26	15%
crime instory	Robbery	9	5%
	Zina	2	1%
	Kidnapping	3	1%
	Drug Supply	5 7	4%
	Encounter Cases and Gambling	5	4% 3%
Psychological issues	Encounter Cases and Gamoling	5	570
i sychological issues	Dreaming about victim	25	14%
		25	14/0

	Disturbed sleep	73	42%
	Flashback of event	59	34%
	Hallucinations	26	15%
Immoral patterns of		110	64%
behavior			
	Lack of remorse of guilt	38	22%
	Blaming other for their acts	98	57%
Familial Support and		128	75%
behaviors			
	Love and care	128	75%
	Legal Support	125	73%
	Financial Support	125	73%

Theme Definitions and Discussion

On the basis of the aforementioned steps, the following themes have been identified as delineating the developmental, cognitive, and psychological characteristics of the murderers.

Theme A: Family instability. Family instability was conceptualized as a collection or combination of different kind of events that confront the daily continuity and cohesiveness of routine family life of the individual. Thus, family instability is described as chronically chaotic and unpredictable family environment.

Results of the current study revealed that family instability was the aggregate of factors that disturbed the family environment (parental bereavement, poor interpersonal relations of parents, in-law's interference, disrupted family (divorce, etc.), poor parenting and disciplining strategies (inconsistent and inappropriate treatment), strict paternal control, maternal interference, and short-tempered parents. Data from the current study revealed that 60% of participants were brought up in unstable families. Major sources contributing to family instability included parental bereavement (52%), disrupted families, and parental conflicts (51%), inconsistent and inappropriate disciplining strategies (harsh and coercive treatments 62%, no discipline or neglect 28%).

Pakistan Journal of Criminology 43

Theme B: Interpersonal relations. Interpersonal relations were conceptualized as a close association between two or more people (from brief to enduring). This association is marked with affection, love, interaction, or some other type of social communication. In the current study, interpersonal relations were described in terms of interpersonal relations with a family member and girlfriends (love affairs). Findings of the current study revealed that participants had poor interpersonal relations with their siblings and family members. Major patterns of behaviors they had with their family members involved stubbornness and aloofness (47%), being naughty, irritating, and quarrelsome (48%). 60% of participants reported having multiple girlfriends at a time and had short-term relations with them.

Theme C: Antisocial behaviors. Antisocial behaviors are described as destructive behaviors marked with obvious hostility and intended aggression directed toward others. Our findings revealed that participants were engaged in antisocial behaviors. Prominent patterns of antisocial behaviors included delinquent patterns of behaviors (drug and alcohol consumption 60%, stealing habits 35%, violent acts towards class fellows and peers 40%, involvement and identification with delinquent groups 62%), non-empathic behaviors (cruelty towards animals, instant gratification and revenge taking), aggression (68%) and self-harming behaviors (31%).

Theme D: Intimate relations. Intimacy is described as a complex combination of passion, love, commitment, and friendship in which two individual experiences a compelling desire for ongoing close interaction with each other. The findings of this study revealed that participants had poor intimate relations. Only 38% of married participants reported marital satisfaction. These individuals reported negative views about women.

Theme E: Reason or causes of committing murder. According to Pakistan Penal code, murder is the unlawful killing of one person by another. Around the world gain factor (zan, zar, zameen) were considered as the basic reason for committing murder. Findings of the current study revealed major reasons for committing murder included revenge and enmity (24%), honor killing (13%), disputes over land and property (12%), sudden provocation and harsh conversation (18%) and during robbery, marriage ceremony, financial and domestic issues and envy (13% reaming). Majority of the murders were unplanned and unintentional. 78% of participants confessed their crime during the interview. Among those who confessed their crime, 79% reported that their acts of committing murder were unplanned and unintentional.

Theme F: Emotional states before and after committing murder. Emotional states involved feelings that result in physical or psychological changes in behavior. Emotional states of murderers differed as reasons for committing murder differed. As revealed by the data, participants showed a variety of emotional states before committing murder. These emotional states included aggression (29%), intense grief (21%), mixed feelings of grief and anger (16%), pride, excitement, happiness, and contentment (12%).

Data also showed murderers experienced a variety of emotional states after committing murder. These emotional states were being fearful and worried (38%), happiness and excitement (21%), contentment (20%), and grief and sorrow (1%). Revenge takers reported positive feelings such as satisfaction, happiness, pride, and excitement; honor killers reported mixed feelings of grief, anger, hatred, calmness, and satisfaction; participants committing murder during a quarrel, sudden provocation, and robbery reported a feeling of intense anger, impulsivity, and fear. Participants who committed murder due to financial and domestic issues said that they felt upset, irritated, annoyed, alone, and depressed.

Theme G: Crime history. Crime history is described as participants' involvement in other criminal acts or any history of the previous imprisonment. Majority of participants reported that they were not involved in other crimes and had no history of imprisonment. Only a few participants reported they committed robbery but had no history of imprisonment. Few participants reported that cases of zina were profiled against them but because these FIRS were fake, therefore they also had no history of imprisonment. Two participants reported that they supplied drugs, and one reported that he gambled. All participants reported that they had no history of imprisonment.

Pakistan Journal of Criminology 47

ناجائزاسلح کاایک کیس تھا۔ اس سے پہلے 337 کاایک کیس تھا۔ ^{کہ}ی جیل کی ہوانہیں کھائی اس سے پہلے۔

Theme H: Psychological issues. In the present study, psychological issues have been conceptualized as disturbed behavior (e.g., poor sleep patterns) and altered states of mind e.g. hallucinations. Data from the current study revealed that participants were experiencing a variety of psychological issues including hallucination (15%), flashbacks of the event (34%), disrupted sleep patterns (42%), and dreaming about the victim (14%). Findings of this study revealed that participants lacked remorse or guilt (22%). They were not ashamed of their acts, instead, they were having pride in them and had blaming attitudes (57%).

Theme I: Immoral patterns of behaviors. Moral patterns of behaviors mean feeling guilty or ashamed about wrong or criminal acts. In the current study, immoral patterns of behavior were conceptualized as having no shame, no guilt, or no remorse on criminal acts. Results showed that murders were not ashamed of their heinous act of killing a human being. They had no remorse or guilt on their acts. Instead of feeling guilty on their heinous acts, some reported having pride in it. Some of them admitted that they were sad and remorseful because they ruin their own future. They had no remorse on the death of the victim. Findings showed that participants were constantly blaming society, victim itself, or other people for their miseries instead of accepting their own mistakes.

میں نے بہت سمجھا یا مگر وہ مسلسل ننگ کر رہاتھا۔ ایسے لو گول کو مر، بی جانا چا ہیے، ان کے مرنے پر افسوس نہیں کیا جاتا۔ میری زندگی تباہ ہو گی، بس اس بات کا افسوس ہے۔

Theme J: Familial support and behaviors. Familial support and behavior were conceptualized as any kind of financial, social, legal, and moral support provided to the offender and attitudes of family members towards him. They were having familial support of every kind. Their families were supporting them financially (73%) and legally (73%). Majority of the participants reported that in the favorable condition they would never commit murder again after redemption. If they had life threats, they would behave in a similar manner.



Figure 3. Schematic presentation of the likelihood of committing murder as the function of major themes identified in the present study.

Conclusion and Recommendations

Our results suggested that acts of murder were not always committed by habitual criminals. Results further revealed that a number of family factors hinder the development of appropriate self-capacities and heightened the development of negative behaviors. Deficits in self-capacities foster the development of antisocial behaviors. These antisocial behaviors negatively influence the development of secure attachment in adulthood that might lead to the development of the lower level of marital satisfaction and instable intimate relationships. Thus, the synergetic effect of these factors instills lower levels of self-control and empathy in individuals. People with poor self-regulation and empathic abilities, act violently when exposed to stressful situations.

Our findings revealed that apparently normally functioning individual had a history of rejection, inconsistent and inappropriate treatment, antisocial impulses, insecure attachment, low levels of self-regulation, and empathy. This study highlights the great need for a family psychologist, criminologist, and a social justice system to consider these factors. Family counseling and parental training programs are needed to reduce the crime rate in Pakistan. This also refers to the active role of the psychologist in educating people to control their anger in provocation situation. Psychological training should be provided in jails in order to manage self-control, aggression, and violence. Counseling should be provided to the family of the victim as well as perpetrators in order to reduce the likelihood of committing murder and recidivism.

References

- Akram, M. B., Abbasi, S. R. S., & Mahmood, Q. K. (2014). Assessment of selfcontrol by measuring risk-seeking behavior among convicted youth in Punjab (Pakistan). World Applied Sciences Journal 32 (5), 802-806.
- Bernhardt, B. C., & Singer, T. (2012). The neural basis of empathy. Annual review of neuroscience, 35, 1-23.
- Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative* research in psychology, 3(2), 77-101.
- Collins, W. A., Maccoby, E. E., Steinberg, L., Hetherington, E. M., & Bornstein, M. H. (2000). Contemporary research on parenting: The case for nature and nurture. *American Psychologist*, 55(2), 218.
- Fonagy, P., & Levinson, A. (2004). Offending and attachment: The relationship between interpersonal awareness and offending in a prison population with psychiatric disorders. *Canadian Journal of Psychoanalysis*, 12(2), 225-251.
- Gottfredson, M. R., & Hirschi, T. (1995). National crime control policies. *Society*, 32(2), 30-36.
- Hashmi, A. H., Hassan, S., Hassan I. H., & Akram, M. (2000). A sociological investigation of murders in the Punjab (Pakistan) province. *Pakistan Journal* of Agricultural Sociology, 37, 1-2.
- Siegel, D. (2008). Diamonds and organized crime: The case of Antwerp. In *Organized crime: Culture, markets, and policies* (pp. 85-96). Springer, New York, NY.
- Skodol, A. E., Johnson, J. G., Cohen, P., Sneed, J. R., & Crawford, T. N. (2007). Personality disorder and impaired functioning from adolescence to adulthood. *The British Journal of Psychiatry*, 190(5), 415-420.
- Suhail, K., & Javed, F. (2004). Psychosocial causes of the crime of murder in Pakistan. *Pakistan Journal of Psychological Research*, *19* (3-4), 161-174.
- Wolfe, S. E., Reisig, M. D. & Holtfreter, K. (2015). Low self-control and crime in late adulthood. *Research on Aging*, 38 (7), 767 – 790.