

Asmat Naz *
Asma Akber **

Politics and Ethnic Identities: Cross-Sectional Provincial Analysis Of Human Security In Pakistan

Abstract

Pakistan is a vital state of South Asian region. Its peace and security is very significant for peace and stability of South Asian region and Global Society. This paper aimed to solve the puzzle of security complex of Pakistan. The challenges to the federal polity of Pakistan since its inception is one of its primary hindrances to the incomplete state-making process as suggested by Muhammad Ayub through Subaltern realistic stand point. This prioritized internal security endeavor by researchers leads towards the relationship between political security and stability with human security approach. The cross sectional provincial analysis of Pakistan suggests that those prominent ethnic identity groups which sustain high status on human developmental index are also politically active ethnic identities in each province or vice versa. Deductive argument suggests the human security toolkit for political stability of Pakistan.

Key Words: Internal security, Political stability, Federalism, Intra-Provincial, Ethno-national movements, Human security, Human Development Indices

Introduction:

Pakistan is a multi-ethnic state with social configuration of diverse identities and cultures. As a result of independence in 1947, multiple ethnic identities with racial and lingual differences settled into a federal state of South Asian region. Different people from different geographical locations and socio-economic background were epistemologically united on the name of Islam. But ontological analysis of the pre-partition situation reveals that the desire to safeguard the societal, political and economic rights of down trodden common masses and power grabbing aspiration of political elites led them towards resistance but with unifying force of Islam which galvanized their cultural diversities. (Saeed, 1980). A loosely knitted federal polity of Pakistan could not accommodate its multiplicity of identities on equal basis which can be gauged in current scenario. However, In order to get a better understanding of the current tribulations of Pakistani ethnic problem widespread in all provinces, it is required to have a retrospective glimpse of these ethnic identities.

Theoretical Essence:

Post-independence ethnic imbalance led towards inequality throughout the Pakistan. Disparities are caused by unequal development and human insecurity.

* Prof Dr Asmat Naz, The Women University Multan.

** Ms Asma Afridi, Lecturer, The Women University Multan.

And this happens due to uneven socio-economic and political opportunities for different identities.(Chenoy, 2009, p. 116) These identity groups in case of Pakistan are also linked in domains of political strength and human development index. The concepts of human security and human development are intersectional concepts. According to definition of human security by United Nations Development Program (UNDP), security from intimidations such as starvation, ailment and subjugation come in the ambit of human security and that the development should be directed equally to all concerned.(Brauch, 2008, p. 23)

Similarly, internal security is advocate by Muhammad Ayoob in realm of state-making procedure and political stability of any third world country like Pakistan. According to Subaltern Realism theory advocated by Ayoob a third world country must focus on its internal political stability on first priority rather than overarching the military institution aimed at securitizing the borders. (Ayoob, 1995)

Retrospective Analysis:

These regions of diverse and peculiar background when assembled in a united state needed a constitutional power of consolidation. In early days of nascent state, constitutional delay founded weak federation with influential centre due to exceptional right of provincial governor nominated by Governor General of Pakistan to seize the powers into his own hand.(Symonds, 1950)Extensive rule of Pax-Britannica in subcontinent executed the nuclear bureaucratic administrative structure and stayed away from representative form of administration. (Shafqat) While maintaining British inheritance, exceedingly centripetal system of federation was introduced imitating the organizational structure of colonial masters.(Saeed, 1980)Before division of sub-continent, areas of Punjab and frontier (Khyber Pakhtunkhwa) were tactically beneficial for colonial master, The Great Britain. Because these places were not only geographically important in security matters of British Empire but also endowed with a greater room for military recruits according to their particular racial traits. (Saeed, 1980) In this way, prioritized racial expression were transferred as a legacy to newly delivered state which later on became active in exploiting other races, each group dominating the others in their respective provinces such as, Punjabis, pashtoons and urdu speaking migrants.

After independence, there was clear mutation in ethnic balances in different provinces due to large influx of migrants form Indian part of sub-continent to newly emerged state. This modified ethnic balance further exacerbated the difficulties of parity at federal level. People of Indian Punjab got well settled in Punjab province of Pakistan due to homogeneity of traditional background, while rest of the migrants from all over the India sought shelter in Sindh metropolitan areas including capital of Pakistan, Hyderabad and Latifabad.

Proposition Of Study

As far as political security and human security in Pakistan is concerned, it is closely linked with each other. These variables fluctuate in resonance in relation to each other which is explained in this document by making an intra-provincial analysis of ethno-political identities of Pakistan. It is assumed by the researchers that political security and human security of ethno-political groups in Pakistan is directly proportional to each other. Those ethnic identities are politically

strengthen in Pakistan which are relatively safe according to human development index or vice versa.

Scheme Of Study:

In this paper, qualitative and quantitative disparities within each province are being highlighted by utilizing reports of human and social developmental indices along with analytical discussions of academia by using social repositories, electronic and printed journals, books, newspapers, blogs, maps, reports and conference paper series and related website pages. In first part, qualitative analysis of each province is discussed while in later section this claimed disparity within the provinces is argued in quantitative manner by employing facts and figures.

Federalism as a chequered legacy: a state-making crisis of Pakistan:

In contemporary era, in this conflict oriented world with accommodation of multiple genres of population, federalist perspective (bifurcation of administrative setup in central government and autonomous federating units within the state) presents the system by which peace can be ensured by streamlining the differences of inhabitants within a state.(Stanford encyclopedia of philosophy).However, as far as Pakistan is concerned, since its foundation, it is victim of challenges of federalism. (Chandio, 2013). A variety of reasoning factors can be highlighted in this regard, which emphatically bring the matters into light. Before discussing these factors, it is quite pertinent here to mention that these same aspects were responsible to escalate grievances within each province which is main concern of our paper. Most prominently amongst all is dictatorial form of government and unhindered intervention of military bureaucracy in state affairs. Non-representative system worsened the federal situation. Pakistani armed forces always remained indulged in politics as it is evident from repeated military coups and in sustenance of muscular centre as compared to provincialism but now a shift has been observed in policy of Pakistani armed forces by an attempt to abolish its ethnic bias (Punjabi and pashtoon dominancy) to promote harmony among provinces but in fact sketching for another agenda to ensure centralist tendencies in Pakistan.(Siddiq) Experience of one-unit system blocked execution of federalism and eventually resulted in 1971 debacle which is a clear example of collapse federal structure in Pakistan.(Chandio, 2013) This experience also aggravated the situation within the provinces because previously recognized identities inside provincial entities could not resume their status even after the abolition of one-unit system, for example, status of Bahawalpur region.

Intra-Provincial Agitations:

Actually, obliteration of one-unit structure brought the intra-provincial disparities into lime light and all ethnic movements erupted with a real vigor in 1970's.On conventional grounds, federation requires a constitutional platform for its effectual functionality but ontologically its accomplishment depends primarily on the political determination. (Hasnat, 2012). Uneven accommodation of ethnic diversities of federal units originated form over domination of particular racial representation in establishment of Pakistan such as, overly controlled by Punjabi and Pashtoons at the utter neglect of rest of the racial or lingual representations. But this disparity does not solely exist among provincial entities while it is deep rooted even within the provinces negating the simple binary prevalence in Pakistan

usually named as Punjab versus rest. These intra- provincial ethnic identities are complicatedly interwoven along many lines

- Linguistic cleavages
- Ethnic differentiation
- Rural-urban divide
- Natives versus settlers

Holistic picture of provinces of Pakistan presents a scenario of internal diversities in all these provinces for example there exists a sharp conflict between migrants and local sindhis in sindh, siriki-punjabi fissure in Punjab, hindko speaking hazaras and pashtoon's rift in KPK and in Balochistan we see that Balochis and Pashtoons are constantly pitting against each other. (Hasnat, 2012) These observational rifts along multiple lines are largely affected by variable of demography. In Demographic mutations post- partition resettlements of population and dynamics of economic activity including resource allocations are largely involved.

According to estimation of Theodore P. Wright, Inter- ethnic conflicts within the provinces are symbolically presenting the alteration of class structure influenced by demographic shifts. These differences are configured in form of 'core-periphery relation' hence are subjected to variation in population size of each ethnic group. (Theodore P. Wright, 1991) This factor indicates the existence of a dominant group, exploiting the subjugated or marginalized conditions of minority or down trodden group. Not only this dominant ethnic expression existing at national level but also at provincial level. Here not to mention Ayoob, a proponent of 'Subaltern realism' theory with comprehensive work on third world countries would be quite injustice to the discussing Phenomenon. Ayoob presents the concept of Mono-ethnic dominant group which supersedes the political organization and becomes a source of inequality resulting into cessation of marginalized entity from dominant expression. (Ayoob, 1995). Moreover, synthetic boundaries of Third world countries chopped down many prominent ethnic identities among states hence rendering them to minority in a particular state. (Ayoob, 1995)

In order to elaborate the problems of disparity of human security at provincial level, It is needed to have a look on internal ethnic dynamism of all provinces. These provinces are going to be discussed in light of Human development Index (HDI) of districts of all provinces in order to highlight their internal disparity. Rationale behind this emphasis on internal inequality of provinces is an attempt to realize the ontological obstacles in way of successful federation. Inequality among provinces at national level do not solely presents the entire picture of problems of federation but actually it is a deep down phenomenon and is in dire need to be addressed. It is required to ponder upon foundational reasons of weak federation and how the consideration of Punjab as only factor this issue can diverge attention of academia and policy makers about these aspects. It can be exemplified for the better understanding of the argument with the assistance of Theodore's view point that there is an incessant possibility of a marginalized ethnic group involvement with powerful group at national level in order to achieve economic, political or representative benefits with the motive of enhancement of its space in power

structure in order to compete dominant group of its own province. (Theodore P. Right, 1991) There is an empirical evidence in this regard that in Pakistan Political representation of migrants in Sind came into alliance with central government of Pakistan Muslim League Nawaz (PMLN) party in 1990's in order to stand against Sindhi Natives Alliance and secured their interests. (Shehzad, 2007).

Analysis of the situation indicates that the dispute and conflict of different ethnic identities lies on control over power and resources in order to safeguard their identity and to raise their living standards.

Conflicted Quagmire of Sindh:

Ethnic arrangement of Sindh is dominated by clash between sindhi local populace and refugees or Urdu speaking people that were settled in metropolitan areas of Sindh at the time of partition. This ethnic identity made a sharp contrast with pastoral population of sindhi speaking section with no educational grooming. In 1980's Urdu spoken populace represented $\frac{3}{4}$ majorities in Karachi city as compared $\frac{1}{2}$ presence of these people right after independence. (Corsi, 2004). This long lasting controversy between both groups is settled along many lines but most importantly the dividing line which dominates the linguistic concerns or ethnic divisions is rural- urban divide or divide of developed and underdeveloped populace. Though sindhi natives are relatively larger in numbers but actually they reside in under developed areas and are far behind urdu speaking people in matters of facilities and employment. The concerns of sindhi people were addressed in during era of prime minister Zulfikar Ali Bhutto by an important initiative on part of ppp government in terms of lessening the gap of development between two expressions of residents by declaring quota system in employment sector which was largely resisted by more competent migrants residing in Sindh. (Hasnat, 2012) Muhajirs, constituting the elite section of Pakistan raised sense of grievances among natives who were victim of exploitation even before partition due to existence of feudal system in Sindh. The claims of antagonistic group can ignite dominant group resulting into violence as happened in the case of Sindh leads towards reciprocal suspicion and stimulate the sense of deprivation among aggrieved masses. (Shehzad, 2007) Unequal dissemination of reserves between under developed areas and developed areas enlarges the gap between privileged and deprived people. (Shehzad, 2007) Not only this binary exists other identities can be also gauged increasing in number such as Pushtuns and Punjabis in most important Metropolitan city Karachi. Not only the rift exists between MQM representative political body of migrants and Sindh national alliance but political scenario highlights Pashtun dominated ANP divergence from MQM political ideology. (Amanullah Sipra, 2011) Furthermore, exercise of violence by these different political expressions in power grabbing competition and resource distribution mechanism further deteriorates the situation. (Majeed, 2014)

Discourse of uneven development at provincial level can be empirically justified by taking a pragmatic view of statistics of human development index (HDI) by observation of several indicators of developed and underdeveloped districts of this province.

Kyber Pakhtunkhaw and uneven development:

‘Hazara qaumi mahaz’ (HQM) is political expression of people living in ‘Hazara’ that developed in 1980’s in order to safeguard their rights from dominated Pashtun Population. (Amanullah Sipra, 2011) Their prominent concern is provision for a separate province based on separate linguistic and ethnic identity. (Amanullah Sipra, 2011) This claim acquired centre of gravity in political debate and power structure with deliberate protests after 18th constitutional amendment due to conversion of provincial name from NWFP to KPK. (Ahmar, 2013) But this slogan could not win electoral support in 2013 due to lack of settlement among all parties that struggled for this purpose. (Ahmar, 2013). Moreover, feud between these two genealogical expressions is not restricted to simple ethno-linguistic conflictual relation in Pakistan but identical situation was ignited in Afghanistan in 1979 of extension of help under the patronage of Iranian and Saudi Arabian governments to each faction and later on this was transmitted to Pakistan during process of migration of these two races from Afghanistan to Pakistan. (Punjani, 2002) Even in refugee areas these both ethnic groups are hostile to each other and Hazara population is forced to live in urban areas of Peshawar, outside the refugee communities, in order to escape exploitation and violence by Afghan pashtuns thus being deprived of humanitarian aid by foreign donors. (Punjani, 2002) This factor indicates the lingo-ethnic disharmony and these two adversary racial groups. Following facts and figures empirically strengthen the argument of exploitation of one group by other.

Balochistan:

Prominent racial sections of Balochistan society includes Pashtoons, Balochis, Makranis and Barohis. According to national census report of 1998

Balochis+Barohis	55%
Pashtoons	30%
Sindhis	06%
Punjabi	03%
Sriki	02%

- 1- Pashtoons are though relatively minor in numbers but are comparatively liberal and socially stable ethnic group than balochi people who are considered socio-politically diffident and unqualified. (Hasnat, 2012) Balochistan entered into political mainstream of Pakistan in 1973 constitution and became a volatile place regarding ethno-lingual conflicts among tribal leaders and conflict of ANP-JUI with central government leading towards diffidence of ‘Mengals’ and ‘Marris’ tribes. (Shehzad, 2007). It can be argued here that clans of Balochistan were segregated on the basis of association with centre’s controversial attitude towards them. Baloch people want to employ quota system on the basis of demographic factor while opponent ethnic refuted this stipulation because of their better educational and liberal outlook and also short an optimum political representation. (Aslam, 2009) Tribal leaders called ‘sardars’ from south and central areas of Balochistan usually occupy high-flying positions in mainstream power structure. (Hamid, 2013) Balochs and Pashtoons are

hostile towards each other because both factions clamor against the seizure of their possessions by opponent group. (Akbar, 2010) Balochs rebuff the equivalent allocation of assets to both ethnic communities because of existence of all resource rich explored sites in their area and minimal demographic representation of pashtuns in only 8 small sized districts rather than majority of Balochs in 22 districts.(ibid) A concern for splitting the province into two is also in vogue due to historical background of 'treaty of Gandamak' in 1879 between British imperial forces and Afghan 'amir' according to which Certain afghan land areas were handed over to British crown populated by Pashtuns and later were incorporated in Pakistan at the time of partition of subcontinent. (Matin, 2012)

Political division in people of balochistan can be depicted in a better way by employing the difference of Ethnic groups and ethno-national movements. Ayoob defines ethnicity or ethnic movements as a struggle of identity with socio-economic recognition and political representation within a state while ethno national insurgencies aspire for separate geographical entity with total independence and sovereignty on basis of claims of separate nation.(Ayoob, 1995) In Balochistan, the political atmosphere is sharply partitioned between tribes having separatist tendencies and tribes with federal orientations.

Pro-autonomic groups

(Baloch parties)

BLA

BLF

BRA

BLUF

Lashkr-e Balochistan

Sarbaz Balochistan
(awami/mengal)

(Amanullah Sipra, 2011)

Liberal democratic parties

(Pashtun except last)

Pakhtunkhwah Milli Awami Party

Awami National Party

JUI-F

PML(Q)

PPP/PMLN

Balochistan national party

This discussion depicts that disparity within this province runs along many criteria. On the one hand it exists between pashtuns and balochis and on the other hand this province can be distinguished between tribal political setup and deprived citizens. Pashtuns are representatively deprived but their areas are far better than Balochs in sectors of Knowledge, health, water supply and economy. We can assume that areas where feudal representation is high, those are having low ranking in human development sectors and that's why separatist parties exist those areas.

Punjab and Saraiki movement:

During the age of colonization, Imperial policies impinged on the ethno-linguistic balance and merged two chronological distinct regions of sub-continent into one for their own interests. In post-partition situation, migrants from eastern Punjab disturbed this balance further in the favor of Punjabis. (Langah)Alignment of this

language with the Punjabi language through rendering it as an offshoot or versatile accent of Punjabi was made with the intellectual dishonesty of publication of Saraiki literature under the name of Punjabi language. (Langah) Saraiki movement belongs to southern Punjab which is underdeveloped area of region with minimal facilitation in different social sectors. This southern region is highly dominated by central Punjab which is according to social indicators not only the well developed area of Punjab but also of most influential area of Pakistan. Conflict between central and western Punjab runs along linguistic lines and it is also considered as underdeveloped area largely ignored by upper Punjab. People here started to realize their deprivation in 1960's but during military regime pace of Saraiki movement got down which was revived later. Tentative extinction this movement was happened due to one-unit scheme mainly led by Punjab as result province of Bahawalpur was amalgamated into all west-Pakistan and was opposed by Bahawalpur region in particular and from other regions of West Pakistan in general. (Majeed, 2014) But it was lingual movement which after the despotic rule of Gen. Zia-ul-Haq reappeared in political terms, a demand for a divided province into two. (Fayyaz, 2011) Proponents of this movement demand separation of southern Punjab from rest as a separate federal unit of Pakistan. (Amanullah Sipra, 2011) Dominated Punjabi population with lingual violence is also amongst the pains of people of southern Punjab. Advocates of this movement remonstrate against improper disbursement of funds in Punjab by extracting more revenue from its southern part while spending very little and also due to enhanced habitation of people from distinct genre. (Fayyaz, 2011) According to Dr. Ayesha Siddiqi, upper Punjab dominancy is more potent due to large number of recruits in armed forces from this upper-central region of Punjab. (Fayyaz, 2011) There are two schools of thought however which alternatively argue about its division on lingual or administrative basis. One faction intend to segregate it on basis of geographical partition between underdeveloped southern districts and developed northern part while other emphasize the genealogical monotony of particular language and suggested for creation of new entity by accumulating all Saraiki speaking personages residing currently in other provinces as well. (Fayyaz, 2011) According to holistic analysis of developed and underdeveloped districts of all provinces, it is evident that people belonging to marginalized community is involved in campaigns of separate province or home land. In each province of Pakistan conflicting groups are unevenly developed and struggling against dominant ethnic faction.

Intra-provincial disparities: Human and Social Developmental Quantitative Analysis

Human development ranking of districts from each province is given below in the table. Districts which are showing low figures in index ranking in each province are dominated by marginalized ethnicities. For instance, in column of Punjab, districts at bottom are Saraiki inhabited areas. Similarly in rest of the columns all bottom districts with low ranking are populated by, Sindhi native people, Hazara people and Balochs people respectively. While on the other hand, districts which are settled in top ranking according to HDI figures are mostly those areas which inhabit dominant ethno-lingual distinctiveness with a few exceptions such as Abbotabad and Haripur which are though located in Hazara division but show good ranking. . Here it is important to mention that exceptional cases of districts

exist in each column. And there is a lack of sharp dividing line among ethnic groups of provinces regarding development or underdevelopment. But mostly it is the case that districts which are with low ranking inhabit particular ethno-lingual identities. Furthermore, Human development index ranking at district level of each province continuously is running down which is evident of the fact that in each province is facing unequal development by giving privilege to dominant ethnic group by marginalizing others.

Intr-Provincial Human Security Conditions

This study is carried out with very limited districts selection and with limited data recourses. However, in order to overview the social development and living standard of each province, three indices, education, health and water and sanitation are observed on district basis in each province along rural-urban divisions. Three developed districts (dominant ethnic group) and three most underdeveloped districts (marginalized ethnic group) from each province are selected. In Punjab muzaffargarh, D.G.Khan and Rajanpur are srikik districts(was), in Sindh Tharparker, Thatta, Kahmoor districts have sindhi native population, in KPK hazaras dominated districts are Batgram, Kohistan and Torgarh(The Khber Pkhtunkhwa Tribune, 2011) and in Balochistan Baloch dominated districts are Awaran, Panjghar and Kharan(www2). Figures in tables indicate that all these districts are in bad condition according to these basic indices of social development. Following tables of each district are note solely divided along horizontal parameter based on ethno-linguistic cleavage but also depict that all provinces carry a fissure along rural-urban uneven development. The point here is to mention that there is a considerable link between political stability and human development of any ethno-political identity group of each province. Under development is an ‘organic’ phenomenon in Pakistan and there is a need to look it into inter-related political and human security approaches.

Human Development Ranking: District Analysis at Provincial Level(Khan, 2007)

Punjab	HDI	Sindh	HD I	KPK	HD I	Blochista n	DHI
--------	-----	-------	---------	-----	---------	----------------	-----

Jhelum	.769		.788		.733		.699
Sheikhupura	8		5	Haripur	9		4
Kasur	.730	Karachi	.709	Abbottabad	.730	Ziarat	.65
Bhakkar	1	Ghotki	0	Mardan	4	Pishin	6
Gujranwala	.713	Nawabshah	.692	Swabi	.676	Turbat	2
Sahiwal	2	Sukkur	1	Kohat	3	Mastung	.65
Chakwal	.705	Hyderabad	.690	Swat	.675	Chagai	1
Toba Tek Singh.	.695	Mirpurkhas	2	Malakand	6	Jaffarabad	0
Lahore	.695	Dadu	.680	Nowshera	.672	Nasirabad	.64
Sialkot.	5	Khairpur	6	Peshawar	7	Lasbela	4
Khushab	.693	Sanghar	.671	Charsadda	.665	Loralai	.63
Mundi Bahuddin . Leiah.	.693	N. Feroz	1	Karak	7	Kalat	2
Mianwali	2	Badin	.668	Mansehra	.590	Barkhan	.60
Hafizabad	.688	Shikarpur	.660	Chitral	.655	Panjgur	4
Pakpattan	2	Thatta	3	D.I.Khan	55	Kharan	3
Faisalabad	.688	Larkana	.637	an	3	Zhob	.59
Okara	2	Jacobabad	.67	Lakki-Marwat	.639	Quetta	9
Khanewal	.685	Tharparkar	.630	Bannu	1	Khuzdar	8
Sargodha	1		.628	Dir	.629	Qilla	.59
Jhang	.684		8	Lower	3	Saifullah	9
Narowal	9		.628	Buner	.617	Awaran	4
Rahimyar Khan	.682		0	Dir	6	Sibi	.58
Attock	8		.614	Upper.	.614	Qilla	8
Bahawalnagar	.681		7	Shanglana Tank	4	Abdullah	8
Multan	9		.594	Hangu	.606	Bolan	.587
Vehari	.679		3	Battagram	2	Gwadar	3
Rawalpindi	3		.588	Kohistan	.594	Jhal	.579
Gujrat.	.672		.548		7	Magsi	9
Rajanpur	9		3		.57	Musa	2
D.G. Khan.	.672		.542		87	Khel	.55
Muzaffargarh	2		22		4		5
	.669		8				9
	6		.3				7
	.667		13				.5
	1		7		.583		5
	.661				8		8
					.583		

Bahawalpur	6				4		4
Lodhran	.658				.577		.5
	9				6		3
	.655				.5		9
	3				58		7
	.652				5		.525
	8				.5		1
					34		.518
					2		1
	.652				.5		
	2				06		
					4		.499
	.647				.4		7
	0				94		.4
	.643				1		9
	7				.490		7
	.643				4		6
	0				.470		.467
	.638				5		4
	1						
	.636						.457
	7						4
	.634						.4
	7						4
	.630						9
	7						2
	.620						.434
	1						7
	.618						.4
	2						2
	.614						1
	4						9

Table # 1 *INTERA-PROVENCIAL DISPERITY IN PUNJAB BY SOCIAL AND LIVING STANDARDS INDICATORS*

PUNJ	EVER	ADULT	BASIC	ON	DRINK	TYPE
AB	ATT	LITE	HEALT	REC	ING	OF
	END	RACY	H	ORD	WA	FLU
	ED	-	UNIT	-	TER	SH
	SCH	POP		FUL	-	TOI
	OOL	LATI		LY	TAP	LET
		ON		IMM		

		UNI ZED											
		Ur	R	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	R	Ur	R	Ur	R
		b	u	b	r	b	r	b	u	b	u	b	u
		a	r	a	a	a	a	a	r	a	r	a	r
		n	a	n	l	n	l	n	a	n	a	n	a
			l						l		l		l
Lahore	82	6	80	60	94.	87.	77	66	85	15	99	92	
	80	7	76	62	9	0	87	89	54	16	98	86	
Gujrat	82	7	80	65	62.	62.	88	83	54	34	95	83	
		1			3	3							
Jhelum		7			7	7							
		9			100	89.							
					.	1							
					0	5							
					0								
Muzaf farghar	73	4	69	39	24.	40.	36	30	3	3	95	53	
	69	5	65	34	1	7	62	47	54	22	89	35	
D.G. Khan	68	4	64	27	34.	40.	64	76	35	7	98	46	
		3			1	8							
Rajapur		4			2	5							
					38.	55.							
					4	2							
					2	6							

Source: (Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey (Pslm) 2012-13 Provincial/District, 2014)

Table # 2 *INTERA-PROVENCIAL DISPERITY IN SINDH BY SOCIAL AND LIVING STANDARDSINDICATORS*

SINDH	EVER	ADULT	BASIC	ON	DRINK	TYPE
	ATT	LITER	HEALT	REC	ING	OF
	END	ACY-	H	ORD	WAT	FLUS
	ED	POPUPU	UNIT	-	ER-	H
	SCH	LATIO		FUL	TAP	TOIL
	OOL	N		LY		ET
				IMM		

	UNIZ ED											
	Ur b a n	R u r a l	Ur b a n	Rur a l	Ur b a n	Ru r a l	Ur b a n	R u r a l	Ur b a n	R u r a l	Ur b a n	R u r a l
Karachi	84	53	83	36	74. 0 2	36. 3 4	76	51	87	56	99	52
Hydera bad	70	45	72	47	83. 1 4	41. 3 1	51	37	83	16	95	37
Dadu	73	54	69	53	57. 4	37. 8	71	60	13	07	82	24
Tharpar ker	72	42	66	35	57. 4	37. 8	57	25	68	03	88	04
Thatta	59	33	58	32	2 32.	7 38.	15	06	11	00	91	28
Kasmoo r	55	34	59	31	1 6	9 8	45. 3 5	40. 1 1	81. 8 2	51. 1 5		

Source: (Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey (Pslm) 2012-13 Provincial/District, 2014)

Table # 3 INTERA-PROVENCIAL DISPERITY IN KPKBY SOCIAL AND LIVING STANDARDSINDICATORS

KPK	EVER ATTE NDED SCHO OL	ADULT LITE RACY - POPU LATI ON	BASIC HEALT H UNIT	ON RECO RD - FULL Y IMM UNIZ ED	DRINKI NG WAT ER- TAP	TYPE OF FLUS H TOIL ET						
	Ur b a	Ru r a	Ur b a	Ru r a	Ur b a	Ru r a	Ur b a	Ru r a	Ur b a	Ru r a	Ur b a	Ru r a

	n	l	n	l	n	l	n	l	n	l	n	l	
Peshawar	67	53	63	46	93.	67.	76	67	79	25	89	75	
					4	9							
					4	7							
Abbotabad	87	71	85	66	100	79.	70	79	87	78	99	79	
	81	72	77	65	.	6	67	73	94	58	98	86	
					0	4							
					0								
Haripur	0	49	0	39	40.	38.	1	0	35	0	77	0	14
	0	30	0	25	9	5	0	10	0	6	0	37	
					1								
Batagram	0	27	0	15			0	0	0	68			
						38.							
					0.0	4							
					0	4							
Kohistan					0.0	17.							
					0	0							
					0.0	0							
Torgh					0	26.							
						8							
						6							

Source: (Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey (Pslm) 2012-13 Provincial/District, 2014)

Table # 4 INTERA-PROVENCIAL DISPERITY IN BLOCHASTAN BY SOCIAL AND LIVING STANDARDS

BLOC	EVER	ADULT	BASIC	ON	DRINKI	TYPE
HIST	ATTE	LITE	HEALT	REC	NG	OF
AN	NDE	RACY	H	ORD	WAT	FLUS
	D	-	UNIT	-	ER-	H
	SCH	POPUP		FULL	TAP	TOIL
	OOL	LATI		Y		ET
		ON		IMM		
				UNIZ		
				ED		
Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur
Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru
Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur
Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru
Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur
Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru
Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur
Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru
Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur
Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru	Ur	Ru

Quetta	74	54	70	49	31.	57.	57	45	86	71	80	53
Ziarat	70	30	63	50	9	5	0	32	81	25	52	6
Pishin	63	55	59	50	9	0	52	39	93	82	82	38
					33.	49.						
					1	8						
					0	4						
					54.	48.						
					2	9						
					4	0						
Awaran	0	37	0	41	0.0	23.	0	42	0	10	0	6
Punjgh	0	0	0	0	0	6	0	0	0	0	0	0
ar	60	51	50	40	0.0	8	11	42	81	25	86	5
Kharan					0	0.0						
					5.9	0						
					7	21.						
						0						
						0						

Source: (Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey (Pslm) 2012-13 Provincial/District, 2014)

Conclusion:

Pakistan is a multi-ethnic state of South Asia and inhabits people with racial segregation, sectarian divide and lingual diversities. In post-colonial setup, nascent state of Pakistan faced a crisis of state making and could not reconcile these provincial entities in a strong federation due to different background of each province in colonial setup. Financial burden on Pakistani state and constitutional delay further aggravated the situation and Pakistan became the prey of internal colonialism resulting into its dismemberment in 1971. Major demographic shifts after migration had disturbed the ethnic balance in each province which remained in continuity during uneven industrial development in Pakistan. So the problem of Pakistani federation is not limited to discourse of unevenness among federating units. Deep analysis on empirical grounds reveals the other part of reality. Simple binary logic of Punjab versus marginalized others is mistaken on ontological grounds. But the matter of the fact is that the dominant ethnic group in each province is obliged or marginalized politically and at development index at the same time. District analysis of each province in the light human development index ranking and certain developmental indices empirically validates that politically deprived ethnic groups are also suffering regarding human development. It could be suggested that in order to safeguard political security in Pakistan, it is needed to work on fulfilling the parameters of Human security. Moreover, state-making process could be completed or ethno national agitations could be pacified by raising the living standards of citizens of Pakistan.

Bibliography

- (n.d.). Retrieved from www.google.com.pk/search?q=map+of+balochistan&source=lnms&tbm=isch&sa=X&ei=q9ZkU_C_O5Gd7gaXhYDwBA&sqi=2&ved=0CAYQ_AUoAQ&biw=1093&bih=534#facrc=_&imgdii=_&imgrc=PZCqEZ3mIGwrCM%253A%3BuRJV-OMVdQI79M%3Bhttp%253A%252F%252Fcache.pakistantoday.com.pk%252F2013%2
- (n.d.). Retrieved from www.pakimag.com/files/2011/06/Proposed-Abasin-Division-Battagram-Torghar-Kohistan.jpg
- (n.d.). Retrieved from waseb.files.wordpress.com/2010/04/seraikistan-map.gif
- (n.d.). Retrieved from www.google.com.pk/search?q=map+of+balochistan&source=lnms&tbm=isch&sa=X&ei=q9ZkU_C_O5Gd7gaXhYDwBA&sqi=2&ved=0CAYQ_AUoAQ&biw=1093&bih=534#facrc=_&imgdii=_&imgrc=PZCqEZ3mIGwrCM%253A%3BuRJV-OMVdQI79M%3Bhttp%253A%252F%252Fcache.pakistantoday.com.pk%252F2013%2
- Ahmar, M. (2013). Conflict Prevention and New Provincial Map of Pakistan: A case study of Hazara Province. *Journal of political studies*, 1-19.
- Akbar, M. S. (2010, July 03). *Separate Pashtun areas from Balochistan*. Retrieved April 15, 2014, from wordpress: <http://gmcmisssing.wordpress.com/2010/07/03/separate-pashtun-areas-from-balochistan/>
- Amanullah Sipra, I. G. (2011). *Pakistan Security Challenges*. Centre for Research and Security Studies.
- Aslam, A. M. (2009, December 01). *Pashtun-Baloch Relations in Balochistan*. Retrieved April 13, 2014, from The Pakistani Spectator: A candid blog: <http://www.pkhope.com/pashtun-baloch-relations-in-balochistan/>
- Ayoob, M. (1995). *The third World, Security Predicament, State making, regional conflict and international system*. London: Lynne Reiner publishers.
- Berry, R. S. (1999). Collecting data by indepth interviewing. *British educational research association annual conference* (pp. 2-5). Brighton: University of sussex.
- Brauch, H. G. (2008). Conceptualizing the Environmental Dimension of Human Security in the UN. *International Social Science Journal: Rethinking Human Security*, 19-48.
- Chandio, J. (2013, August 27). *Federal Challenges to Polity: Sindh Perspective*. Retrieved April 12, 2014, from citizens wire: <http://www.citizenswire.com/federal-challenges-to-polity-sindh-perspective/>
- Chenoy, S. T. (2009). *Human Security: Concepts and Implications*. Newyork: Routledge Taylor and Francis Group.
- Corsi, M. (2004). Internal Conflicts in Pakistan. *Oriente Moderno, Nuova serie, Islam in South Asia*, 39-49.
- Fayyaz, M. (2011). *Demand for Saraiki Province*. Islamabad: PILADT.
- Hamid, S. L. (2013). *Balochistan Strategy*. Pakistan Poverty Alleviation Fund(PPAF).
- Hasnat, S. F. (2012). *Pakistan*. New Delhi: Pentagon press.
- Khan, H. J. (2007). *Trends in Regional Human Development Indices*. Social Policy and Development Centre.
- Langah, D. N. (n.d.). *Call for Saraiki Province*. Forum of federations.
- Majeed, R. S. (2014). Saraiki Ethnic Identity: Genesis of Conflict with State. *Journal of political studies*, 79-101.

- Matin, A. (2012, June 07). *Enter the Pashtun-Baloch Divide*. Retrieved April 19, 2014, from The News: www.thenews.com.pk/Todays-News-2-112987-Enter-the-Pashtun-Baloch
- Pakistan Social and Living Standard Measurement Survey (Pslm) 2012-13 Provincial/District*. (2014, April). Retrieved April 19, 2014, from Pakistan Bureau of Statistics: <http://www.pbs.gov.pk/content/pakistan-social-and-living-standards-measurement-survey-pslm-2012-13-provincial-district>
- Punjani, S. (2002). *Hoe Ethnic Religious Identity Influences the Living Conditions of Hazara and Pashtun Refugees in Peshawar*. Cambridge.
- Saeed, K. B. (1980). *Politics In Pakistan*. New york: Praeger publishers.
- Shafqat, S. (n.d.). *Civil services Reform and 18th Amendment*. Lahore: Forum of Federations.
- Shehzad, A. (2007). *Ethnicity in Pakistan(1972-85)*. Islamabad: Higher Education Commission.
- Siddiq, A. (n.d.). *Pakistan Military-Ethnic Balance in the Armed Forces and Problems of Federalism*. Forum of Federations.
- Symonds, R. (1950). State-making in Pakistan. *Far Eastern Survey*, 45-50.
- The Khber Pkhtunkhwa Tribune*. (2011). Retrieved May 02, 2014, from KPK Tribune: <http://kpktribune.com/index.php/en/hazara>