

Farkhanda Khursheed *
Dr. Altaf Ullah**

Ideology of Pakistan and Pakistan Studies: A Study in Correlation and its Impact on Curriculum Development

Abstract

This study unearths the correlation between the ideology of Pakistan and the discipline of Pakistan Studies, and its implications for the curriculum development of the aforesaid discipline in the county. There is a dire need to reconsider the curriculum of this significant discipline keeping in view the pre-requisites of this modern and digital era. With the advent of modern technology and application of scientific methods, not only the traditionally institutionalized methods and approaches of teaching, learning and research have been disappearing but a more rapid development in the prevailing academic environment is constantly occurring day by day. These changing circumstances force the intellectuals and academics to revisit the ideology, history, politics, ethnicity, economics, sociological writings, interpretation and reinterpretation of facts and figures pertaining to the study of our state and society. This study, thus, evaluates two different approaches i.e., primordial approach versus modern approach to understand Pakistan Studies as a full-fledged discipline amongst others. Scaffolding of the former approach is covered by beliefs and religious orientations while the hallmark of the latter is reason, rationality, impartiality and without prejudice.

Keywords: Pakistan, ideology, curriculum, education, Pakistan Studies

Introduction

It is evident that majority of the post-colonial states and societies are necessarily preoccupied with certain important commitments and tasks. They are naturally enthusiastic to meet with different targets by prioritizing various national aims and goals to achieve. In the initial phase of journey, any newly established state needs to focus on intangible development in the form of creating homogeneity, harmony and unanimity throughout the state in order to reinforce the essential and meticulous process of nation-building. Indeed, nation-building stands first among other basic tasks and targets that require constant surveillance and proper head on state level. To perpetuate the process of nation-building, these states and societies have to evolve and develop their own distinct and progressive national ideologies. They try to preserve and interpret their historical records, institutionalize the facts and project their heroes and events according to a specific perspective in order to promote their particular ideological narrative, which may prevail in the value system of their societies.

Education can be used as a medium to accelerate the process of social, economic and political development and ensure intellectual growth in the populace of any newly independent post-colonial state which eventually lead to progress and prosperity, integration and homogeneity in the society, and above all promote common brotherhood across the board. It can be proved as an important tool to strengthen national identity and to develop patriotism among the citizens. The state uses education as a mean to create national spirit that would set aside class, sectarian and regional disparities.¹ For a new homogenized and integrated nation, regional and ethnic loyalties have to forego.² Mass state schooling in national language as medium of instructions and uniform curriculum throughout the state is deemed essential for character building of citizens and promotion of cohesive national identity.³ To achieve

* PhD Scholar, National Institute of Pakistan Studies (NIPS), Quaid-i-Azam University Islamabad.

** Senior Research Fellow, National Institute of Historical and Cultural Research (NIHCR), Centre of Excellence, Quaid-i-Azam University, Islamabad – Pakistan.

¹ Rubina Saigol, *Becoming a Modern Nation: Educational Discourse in the Early Years of Ayub Khan (1958-1964)*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2003), p. 4.

² Rubina Saigol, “*Enemies within and Enemies Without: The Besieged Self in Pakistani Textbooks*”, in *Futures* 37, Issue 9, November 2005), p. 1006.

³ Naureen Durrani, “Pakistan: Curriculum and Construction of National Identity”, in Colin Brock and , Mah-E-Rukh eds. *Education in West Central Asia. Education Around the World*. (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2013), pp. 221-239.

integration at national level, acculturation of the young generation is necessary as it create in them a firm sense of belonging to the nation due to which they deeply respect state symbols like flag, national anthem and the ruling junta.⁴ It is, however, one of the major aims and objectives of educational system in the newly formed nation-states to disseminate the past events in such a way to evoke and strengthen national integration and unity among their people.

Indigenous historiography particularly that accounts writings produced by Muslim writers did play its due role in transmitting ideological thoughts, sentiments and spirit in the citizens of newly established state of Pakistan. Events, occurrences, struggles and challenges of the past collectively formulate history of a nation and nation-state. With this context, history can perform a very crucial role in the promotion of national ideology of a country. History, being a worldly known subject, is being taught across the globe since long. The state finds a malleable strength in this subject and observes how much and to what extent patriotic sentiments should be transferred to the new generation through it. It is a subject which often disseminates the national narrative. It aims to inculcate specific ideology and create loyal citizens especially the young generation. Later on, the discipline of Pakistan Studies, which replaced history at different educational levels, has been a source of propagating the state ideology.

Ideology of Pakistan occupies a pivotal place in the curriculum of Pakistan Studies and is relayed by the state in its specific version. The ‘Ideology of Pakistan’ and ‘Islamic Ideology’ became identical and repetitive theme of the syllabi. The idea to include Islamic ideology was pursued since the establishment of the state. Fazlur Rahman, Minister of Education in the government of Pakistan, in his closing address to the All-Pakistan Educational Conference 1947 expressed:

The education system in Pakistan should be inspired by Islamic ideology emphasizing among many characteristics those of universal brotherhood, tolerance and justice...⁵

The claim that Pakistan is an Islamic ideological state has been repeated so firmly that it is now accepted everywhere as a cliché.⁶ People don’t dare to critically observe the role of ideology and further investigate into the matter in the light of changing circumstances due to the involvement of religion.

The Journey of Ideology from Jinnah to Zia

Like a very few other nation states of the world, Pakistan is said to be an ideological state. The term ‘ideology of Pakistan’ has enigmatically penetrated and came up to occupy a very significant position at national level. The concept of national ideology and national identity has been a very sensitive issue in Pakistan. It ultimately settled on defining a national ideology which approved religion as national identity. The national ideology got permeated with religious ideology to such an extent that it has become hard to segregate both the terms from each other.

It is worth mentioning that the word ‘ideology’ was never used by the founder of Pakistan, Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah, yet he repeatedly gave reference to Islam and Islamic civilization before partition. Justice Munir in his monograph writes:

The Quaid-i-Azam never used the word ideology...in 1962 a solitary member of the *Jamaat-i-Islami* used these words for the first time when the Political Parties Bill was discussed... a member objected that it had to be defined and the person who proposed it replied that the ideology of Pakistan is Islam. The amendment bill was passed without any further question.⁷

⁴ Saigol, *Becoming a Modern Nation: Educational Discourse in the Early Years of Ayub Khan*, p. 9.

⁵ *The Eastern Times*, Lahore, 02 December 1947.

⁶ Jaffar Ahmed, “Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject” in Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir eds. *Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2009), p. 310.

⁷ Pervez Amirali Hoodbhoy and Abdul Hameed Nayyar, “Rewriting the History of Pakistan” in Mohammad Asghar Khan ed. *Islam, politics, and the State: the Pakistan Experience*, London: Zed Books, 1985, <http://www.sacw.net/HateEducation/1985HoodbhoyNayyar06022005.html> accessed on 23 September 2021.

Although it might be an emotional remark but not a logical one because it did not allow reason to be part of the discourse, rather it reinforced belief system in the wake of religion. Moreover, Jaffar Ahmed states:

“the ideology of Pakistan is generally accepted as Islam, but the fact of the matter is that religion and ideology are two distinct entities. Religion is trans-territorial while ideology is a political construct, confined to territory of a nation state, where the people may have diverse cultures, languages, religions or belief systems. Religion and state converge only in theocracies, where religious clergies of one religion dominate other religions and that religion is invoked to construct the ideology of the state.”⁸

Jinnah on many occasions, openly conveyed that Pakistan would be a Muslim state based on the Islamic democratic principles. He time and again expressed that “in any case, Pakistan is not going to be a theocratic state – to be ruled by priests with a divine mission”.⁹ His vision about ideology of the new state is best reflected in his August 11, 1947 address, which made it clear that the identification of society would not be on the basis of religion rather all its members would be equal before law. The great Quaid said:

You are free; you are free to go to your temples, you are free to go to your mosques or to any other place or worship in this State of Pakistan. You may belong to any religion or caste or creed that has nothing to do with the business of the State...you will find that in course of time Hindus would cease to be Hindus and Muslims would cease to be Muslims, not in the religious sense, because that is the personal faith of each individual, but in the political sense as citizens of the State.¹⁰

Indeed, he was conveying the future ideology of a nation state and not that of a theocracy.¹¹

Jinnah often used the terms "Muslim State", "Islamic State" and sometimes simply "State". But those were used loosely, interchangeably, and imprecisely although, one must say the choice of terms was not entirely random. Much depended on the audience to be addressed.¹²

It is evident that such sort of random selection of words and capsulated interpretation was frequently pursued and an ideology that could satisfy the general masses was projected yet it raised some important questions in the minds of intellectuals regarding the matter.

...because of the ideological needs of the state... when Zia-ul-Haq brought his new Islamic vision of Pakistan in 1979. Immediately thereafter, Jinnah had to be entirely resurrected and reconstructed as an Islamic - rather than Muslim - leader.¹³

On 5th July 1977 General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haq assumed power, when the third martial law was imposed in the country in a military coup called ‘Operation Fair-play’. It was initially a caretaker regime with an intention to hold elections within ninety days. Zia’s coup was different from the martial law of 1958, as the former had toppled an elected civilian government which was considered as an act of treason according to the constitution of Pakistan.¹⁴ To legitimize his rule, he had to find a *raison d’etre*, which he found under the shadow of religion. He started

⁸ Ahmed, “Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject” p. 311.

⁹ *Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah Speeches and Statements As Governor General of Pakistan 1947 – 48*, (Islamabad: Services Book Club, Government of Pakistan, 1989), p.157.

¹⁰ Mr. Jinnah’s Presidential Address to the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan, August 11, 1947 http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/legislation/constituent_address_11aug1947.html, accessed on 23 September 2021.

¹¹ Ahmed, “Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject”, p. 312

¹² Pervez Hoodbhoy, “Jinnah and the Islamic State: Setting the Record Straight” in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 42, No. 32 (Aug. 11-17, 2007), pp. 3300-3303.

¹³ *Ibid.*

¹⁴ Constitution of Islamic Republic of Pakistan. Article 6 (mentioned in V. Y. Belokrenitsky and V. N, Moskalenko, *A Political History of Pakistan 1947-2007*, OUP, 2013. p. 264-265)

formulating his policy of Islamization, gaining the support of *ulemas* and cashing on the sentiments of common masses.

Thematic debate about ideology of Pakistan has always been under limelight almost in every regime in our country. Military regimes have often strived to exploit ideology for their legitimacy and perpetuation of rule. The Martial Law of General Zia-ul-Haq clearly had legitimacy issues,¹⁵ and this led the regime to seek remedy in converting Pakistan into a theocratic state.¹⁶ It depended relentlessly on its drive of Islamization to be on the go encompassing all the policies including judiciary, political system, economy, administration, media and education. Another view is that, Zia exploited Islamization with “consummate craftiness for the sake of legitimacy and longevity of his rule.”¹⁷ Ayesha Saddiqa is of the view that Zia played his Islamization card and religious parties to counter the influence of PPP.¹⁸ Zia’s strong religious devotion led him to believe that he had a divine duty to convert Pakistan into a genuine Islamic state. In one of his early speeches after acquiring power shows his intentions clearly; “I consider the introduction of an Islamic system as an essential prerequisite for the country.”¹⁹

Since 1977, the military elites have been proclaiming that they are the protectors of not only the territorial boundaries of the country but also the custodians of the ‘ideological frontiers’ and ‘ideology of Pakistan’. This actually gave them the right or pretext to step into domestic politics any time on the excuse to safeguard Islam and ideology of Pakistan.²⁰ On various occasions General Zia had said, “Pakistan armed forces were responsible for not only safeguarding the country’s territorial integrity but also its ideological basis”.²¹

The process of Islamization immediately started in Zia’s regime and different steps were taken in its implementation. Besides other changes in the system, curriculum was also revised and emphasized on Islamic principles and teaching of ideology of Pakistan. The education policy of 1979 clearly states:

The highest priority would be given to the revision of the curricula with a view of reorganizing the entire content around Islamic thought and giving education an ideological orientation so that Islamic ideology permeates the thinking of the younger generation and helps them with the necessary conviction and ability to refashion society according to Islamic tenets.²²

However, it can be expressed that Zia’s assertion to interpret national ideology in a religious paradigm reflects a primordial approach. There was no room to accept anything other than a specific version of state-owned ideology. Unfortunately, this approach is still in practice and deep rooted in the curriculum of Pakistan Studies and supporting literature.

Primordial vs Modern Approach

This academic discourse regarding the correlation between the ideology of Pakistan and the discipline of Pakistan Studies may be observed in the light of two pertinent approaches i.e. primordial versus modern approach.

¹⁵ Hasan Askari Rizvi, *Military, State and Society in Pakistan*. Sang-e-Meel Publication. Lahore. 2003. p. 170.

¹⁶ Tanveer Khalid, Phd Thesis, *Islamization in Pakistan: A Political and Constitutional Study From 1947-1988*. Karachi University, 2004. p. 211

¹⁷ Masood Akhtar Zahid, “Dictatorship in Pakistan: A Study of the Zia Era (1977-88)” in *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, Vol XXXII, No. 1 (2011), p. 15

¹⁸ Ayesha Saddiqa, *Military Inc.: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, (London: Pluto Press, 2017), p. 102.

¹⁹ *Daily Morning News*, July 6, 1977.

²⁰ Ayesha Saddiqa, *Military Inc.: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, (London: Pluto Press, 2017) p. 258.

²¹ Askari Rizvi, *The Military and Politics in Pakistan, 1977-1986*, (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1996), p. 242.

²² Rubina Saigol, *Knowledge and Identity: Articulation of Gender in Educational Discourse in Pakistan*, (Lahore: ASR Publications, 1995) p.122.

Primordialism is the idea that nations or ethnic identities are fixed, natural and ancient²³... individuals have single ethnic identity which is not subject to change, and which is exogenous of historical processes.²⁴ This approach acknowledges nations as fixed structures existing since the prehistoric period. The group identity is based on primordial attachments as blood, race, language, religion, region etc. and it is deep rooted in the historical experiences.²⁵

Primordial approach emphasizes that nationalism is embedded in traditionalism, while modern approach asserts that nationalism emerges as a result of the process of transition from traditional to modern society. They are of the view that the spread of industrialization, socio-economic, political and cultural conditions associated with industrialization are the main causes for the development of nationalism. Modernity is behind the emergence of nationalism either as a political movement or a doctrine that create nation.²⁶ The exponents of this approach agree that factors which create ethnic identity, such as religion, language, blood ties, are passed on from generation to generation. For example, language is an important component of ethnic identity, but this has changed over the years. People tend to change their language preference for their jobs, their migration to another region and bringing up their children in another society. Even religion has also lost its significance for some people in the modern age.²⁷

The concept of ideology has to be elevated with the changing times, it needs to be revisited according to constantly changing demands of the new age. It should be properly understood in the light of updated empirical data in order to strengthen the state and society simultaneously. If the ideology is static, it does not meet the requirements of new nation-state and its citizens. Practically, it does not fulfil the need of the day unless and until other glaring aspects of this notion would be given adequate space while dealing with the curriculum development of Pakistan Studies across the country. As federal minister of education once stated, “the 21st century is a century of science and technology and it the high level of scientific and technological knowledge that will provide the wherewithal to a nation to progress”.²⁸

The elite or state-centric ideology, which has been imparted through the textbooks of Pakistan studies and other pertinent literature produced since the establishment of Pakistan, seems to be ineffective, inefficient and static in the present digital era. A reshuffling of the concept of ideology and its readjustment is, however, inevitable in order to ensure socio-economic, cultural and political development and above all educational advancement of our society. The re-examination of the notion of ideology is deemed necessary which is considered as an integral part of the discipline of Pakistan studies. The prevailing meaning and explanation of the term ideology of Pakistan can only be updated and acknowledged when errors be deleted, miscalculations be redressed, defects be removed, myths be replaced with reality, emotions be replaced with rationality, disinformation be replaced with facts and figures, and above all beliefs would be replaced with reason and rationality. The journey of Pakistan studies from a minor subject to a full-fledged discipline on the one hand, and its entry into the fold of social sciences on the other, has further raised its significance and academic value. In the aftermath of this entry, Pakistan Studies being part of social sciences must be exposed to scientific method, values and procedures which eventually discourage partiality, bias and value judgement.

²³ Jack Hayward, Brian Barry and Archie Brown, eds. *The British Study of Politics in the Twentieth Century*, (London: Oxford University Press, 2003), p. 330.

²⁴ Murat Bayar, “Reconsidering Primordialism: An Alternative Approach to the Study of Ethnicity”, in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 32.9, (2009), pp. 1-20.

²⁵ Seyma Bilgen, “Differences Between Primordialist and Modernist Approaches To Nationalism” https://www.academia.edu/43177252/DIFFERENCES_BETWEEN_PRIMORDIALIST_AND_MODERNIST_APPROACHES_TO_NATIONALISM accessed on 22 September 2021.

²⁶ Ibid. p.3.

²⁷ Ibid. p. 4.

²⁸ Message from Ms. Zobaida Jalal, Federal Minister for Education, Government of Pakistan at the Inaugural Session of the Conference on “State of Social Sciences and Humanities: Current Scenario and Emerging Trends” organized by Committee on Development of Social Sciences and Humanities, Higher Education Commission (HEC) and United Nation Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO), Islamabad on 15-17 December 2003.

Apparently, science and religion have a strong relationship and inner bonds due to so-called convergence in their respective methods of approach but actually both are found with a sharp divergence as far as their procedures and methods of inquiry is concerned. They appear to be strangers for each other because they share neither language nor mores, values and norms. Hence, they could not journey together as contradiction is but natural between these two different modes of thinking.²⁹ With this prelude, the concept of ideology has to be reinterpreted in the light of scientific method; it should be looked neither into a narrow perspective nor in the mirror provided by any religion or belief system. Historically, the ideology solely backed with religious sentiments was put to test in 1971 and eventually faced a tough situation. The religious ideology was damaged. This is assumed that if we take the concept of ideology out of religious paradigm, it will be damaged. That is why, the slogan that 'Islam is in danger' is often used by different regimes and ruling elites for their ulterior motives.³⁰

However, ideology of our state at present is still in an embryonic state which does not comply with the exigencies of state and general requirements of our multi-colour society in this digital era. It needs reinterpretation and updated explanation of the term ideology in the light of authentic source materials to present a holistic picture of the concept of ideology in general and ideology of Pakistan in particular. It is wonderful to mention that during the course of our research we do consult literature produced by foreign scholars or western writers and consider it more authentic than others. Beside it, we have borrowed institutional structure, organizational framework, legal, administrative, economic and educational system from British. But it is astonishing to observe that their state and society after a prolonged and bitter experience in the wake of crusade wars, have ultimately inscribed an obvious line of action regarding the role of religion in politics and in the collective affairs of state. Contrary to that, we subsumed religion and politics together and still we face its repercussions. In the post-debacle scenario (1971), we needed to revisit the notion of ideology and reinforce the correlation between the ideology of Pakistan and the discipline of Pakistan Studies keeping in view the needs and necessities of the new age in which economic factors seems speak high. If we follow the concept of ideology with only one-single element being the central pillar of the whole concept, nothing else would be our destiny but inertia, stagnation and decay.

Ideology of Pakistan and Pakistan Studies

The tragic incident of 1971 resulted in the separation of East from West Pakistan and this bifurcation created Bangladesh in the same year as a separate political polity on 16th December. It really stroked the minds of historians, analysts, academicians, educationists and general intelligentsia and compelled them to revisit and investigate the pros and cons of this mega debacle which disturbed national life. Hence, the introduction of such an academic programme was needed which could carry an in-depth study of the country, create basic knowledge about it, develop positive attitude among its citizens, evolve national cohesion and promote solidarity and integrity across the board. This sort of discipline comes under Area Studies which is elaborated as:

Area study programmes tend to work on the assumption that the people of a definable geographical sector, acting in their society and environment, offer an appropriate unit for scholarly attention.³¹

Pakistan Studies was conceived for the sake of promoting cohesion, harmony and integration within the Pakistani society. This can be understood from three aspects; firstly, to make the individuals knowledgeable about themselves, secondly, to comprehend their country and thirdly, to know the world around them to understand the importance of socio-economic development, ideological advancement and political system of Pakistan. Nonetheless, it is hoped that this discipline will push an effective cycle of socialization at national level, betterment of society and

²⁹ Science and Religion are totally different world views and their outlook on life and of life is not only contradictory but mostly antagonistic and conflicting. There is complete divergence in their approaches. The history of relationship between religion and science is indeed the history of perpetual schism and constant mistrust. Ghulam Qasim Khan Marwat, "Science and Religion: From Conflict to Conversation" in *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, Vol. XXIX, No.1 (2008), pp. 76-77.

³⁰ Asaf Hussain, *Elite Politics in An Ideological State: The Case for Pakistan*, (England: Wm Dawson and Sons Ltd, Cannon House, Folkestone, Kent, 1979), pp. 30-32.

³¹ Saeeduddin Ahmad Dar and Sarfaraz Hussain Ansari. "Pakistan Studies; A Report on the State of the Discipline in Pakistan". N.I.P.S, Report No. 1. Quaid-i-Azam University. 1988, p. 2.

inculcation of patriotism in the general masses throughout the country. Practical implications can be observed in the form of policy makers, experts and administrators who are imbued with Pakistani spirit.³²

In this respect, the department of Pakistan Studies was established in Islamabad University (Later Quaid-i-Azam University) in 1973. According to Pakistan Study Centre Act XXVII of 1976, several autonomous institutions were envisaged to be the proper instruments for the promotion of Pakistan Studies.³³ Pakistan Study Centres aimed to study the languages, literature, social structure, institutions, customs, social behaviours and motivations of the people of various regions of Pakistan.³⁴

The textbooks of Pakistan Studies are solely responsible to embody the notion of ideology, develop a cohesive understanding regarding it at national level, and then project this ideology as national ideology of Pakistan. But whatever the writers of these books have written about the ideology over the years, the concept has been imprinted on the minds of the students, and there is no other source which can enhance or counter this narrative. Since its conception, Pakistan Studies was adopted by the state mainly to propagate its own narrative since 1970s. It was made a compulsory subject in the Martial Law regime of General Muhammad Zia-ul-Haq at all levels of education throughout the country and it was used to disseminate a particular ideology based on a narrow version of faith.

Teaching and Curriculum of Pakistan Studies

In fact, curriculum development and designing are a technical and not profitable venture but despite that, many efforts have been made to frame a feasible structure of the teaching and curriculum of Pakistan Studies. In 1978, it was declared compulsory at secondary, intermediate and graduate levels. Eventually, the curricula developed for Pakistan Studies evolved a common framework which was reproduced time and again at different levels of education. During the process of scrutiny, it seems that major themes at every level even at the post graduate level³⁵ are similar in one way or the other. The common themes of all these textbooks are; ideology of Pakistan, struggle for freedom based on two-nation theory with references to Quaid-i-Azam and Allama Iqbal, initial problems of the new state, constitutional development focusing on Islamic provisions in the constitutions, land of Pakistan, economic and industrial development, steps for Islamization, Pakistan and the Islamic world, and Pakistan as a welfare state.

It is evident that subsequent ruling regimes particularly the military regime of Zia took remarkable steps to introduce Pakistan Studies as compulsory subject to be taught at all levels of education across the country. But unfortunately, its original spirit was not fully understood, and its curriculum was designed in such manner which could only present and project one side of a single coin. This elite-centric projection denied the subject from becoming a delightful multi-disciplinary discipline, otherwise it could have become a true platform to help the nation in understanding its past, present and future.³⁶ An impartial and unbiased observer would find it wonderful to look at a glance to the indexes and contents of different books of Pakistan Studies because he would hardly observe

³² Ibid. p.3.

³³ It provides the basis for the establishment of Pakistan Study Centres in different universities of Pakistan. Being an Act of Parliament, it defines a comprehensive structure for each centre such as the composition of its Board of Governors, a highest administrative body, appointment of the Director, his powers, functions and responsibilities, structure of the academic committee, financial power and autonomy, and other functions of the center. The Pakistan Study Centres Act, 1976 (ACT No. XXVII OF 1976).

³⁴ Government of Pakistan, *The National Assembly of Pakistan Debates, Official Report* (Karachi: Manager Publications, n.d.), Vol. 1, No. 5, 5 March 1976, p. 257. Also see Jaffar Ahmed, "Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject" in Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir eds. *Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2009), p. 320.

³⁶ Ahmed, "Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject" p. 311.

even slight modification in their topics and themes embodied in the contents and indexes of these books. At every level, the first chapter in Pakistan Studies books is always on ‘Ideology’.³⁷

It is frequently observed that at matriculation level, initial portion or first chapter of the textbooks deals with the matter of ideology by giving a very common and beautiful title i.e., ‘Ideological Basis of Pakistan.’ A very random explanation of the notion of ideology is given in the beginning while extra focus is given to Islamic society and sources of Islamic ideology. National ideology and Islamic ideology are conferred upon the students as substitutable terms which mean the same. While dealing with sources of ideology it has been stated, “the values and traditions, such as festivals,³⁸ gatherings and ceremonies which do not run opposites to the teachings of Islam, are allowed to be followed by the Muslims in their respective regions”.³⁹ While emphasizing the importance of ideology, the same textbook include that ideology can be useful for social interaction, it can be a motivating force for national strength and can play its due role in the progress and prosperity of the society, it helps in selecting a good leadership and to make right decisions. It also helps in preserving freedom, culture and traditions. Here no mention of religion is obvious, but in the next section, it is insisted that the religion is a binding force for the nations, and they are distinct on the basis of their religion. Again, this is something which can’t be proved at international level. Culture is independent of religion as it is social heritage and religion is associated with divine doctrines. In the discipline of Pakistan Studies, culture is entrapped in religious paradigm which is something astonishing.

Moreover, it is written very clearly that the basis of our ideology is Islam. The basic principles of Islamic faith are also given in details which are basically coming under the domain of Islamic Studies. It is amazing to note that in these textbooks the ideology of Pakistan is being proved from Jinnah’s and Iqbal’s statements. In fact, both these great leaders never used the word ideology in their speeches and other deliberations. In the end, it is stressed that national character can only be achieved by having an ideology which is again connected with Islamic beliefs, patriotism, being honest and doing hard work in the context of religion. Academic exercises given almost in the end of each chapter of these textbooks are just straight questions. Fill in the blanks section is also very easy and encourage rote learning, there is nothing to urge the students to conduct critical analysis of any issue. There are no thought provoking exercises for the students.⁴⁰

In the like manner, the textbooks at intermediate level also present a redundant approach regarding the notion of ideology of Pakistan. As a prelude to the textbook, a revised syllabus with its objectives as prescribed by the Ministry of Education, Government of Pakistan, is given. Going through its contents, one feels astonished that after nearly thirty-four years no prominent change has been witnessed in the headings of this subject. It follows the same contents, objectives and the order of the chapters.⁴¹ The first chapter is about the Genesis of Pakistan, with the very first heading of ‘Ideology’, but the portion starts with the historical narrative with a fictional touch, “O Hajjaj

³⁷ Three textbooks have been chosen for this study to be thoroughly observed i.e. (i) matriculation, (ii) intermediate, and (iii) undergraduate to compare and comprehend the concept of ideology as explained in these books. The necessary elaboration of these book in bibliographical format is as follow: (i) Pakistan Studies for Classes IX – X, Sindh Textbook Board, Jamshoro. Azam Sons, Karachi. April 2015, (ii) M. D. Zafar, Pakistan Studies for F.A./ F.Sc. & Commerce. Aziz Publishers, Urdu Bazaar, Lahore. 1987, and (iii) Ikram Rabbani, Comprehensive Book of Pakistan Studies, the Caravan Book House. Lahore. 2008.

³⁸ Here the important thing was to educate the students about the difference between traditions, culture and religion. Basant is a cultural festival, but it had been officially banned and declared un-Islamic in Pakistan since long.

³⁹ Pakistan Studies for Classes IX – X, Sindh Textbook Board, Jamshoro. Azam Sons, Karachi. April 2015.

⁴⁰ The title of the first chapter of the concerned textbook is “Ideological Basis of Pakistan”. The whole chapter revolves around religion as a central pillar of ideology of Pakistan. It obviously neglects certain important segments such as economic factors, socio-cultural factors, multi-linguicism and multi-culturalism etc.

⁴¹ The second book that has been chosen is from intermediate level is M. D. Zafar, Pakistan Studies for F.A./ F.Sc. & Commerce. Aziz Publishers, Urdu Bazaar, Lahore. 1987. This book was published in General Zia’s period.

come to our help! O Hajjaj protect us! These are the cries heard on the high seas when ships carrying widows and children of Arab traders in Ceylon were attacked by the sea robbers of Sind...⁴²

It encircles topics such as the advent of Islam, Muslim rules including Ghaznavids, Ghoris, Delhi Sultanate, the Mughals and then the role of religious personalities like Shah Wali Ullah, Mujaddid Alf-Sani, the coming of Europeans, British and whatever went on after that in the sub-continent till the establishment of Pakistan. The historical narrative does not stop here, it again goes back in different times to merely focus on the role and penetration of Islam in this region. It deals with the matters that how did Islam gradually become a dominant religion and the Muslims became a major community. Then the ideology of Pakistan is discussed but again the narrative goes back to cover historical perspective of freedom movement including the role of *mashaiekh*, *ulema*, the British and many others. The initial chapter of the textbook also covers the post-independence developments. In narrating the role of *ulema*, many are applauded for their contributions in the freedom struggle, but no criticism has been made regarding mistakes and blunders done by some of the religio-political leadership and spiritual lords of the common people at that time.⁴³ While dealing with two-nation theory and the Pakistan Resolution, a considerable know-how of the whole notion of ideology of Pakistan and two nation theory seem to be either missing or in embryonic state which needs to be made obvious to the students and general readers. Beside it, Chaudhary Rehmat Ali's coinage of the term 'Pakistan' is portrayed.⁴⁴ The exercises at the end are again stereotyped, they do not contain any incentive for the students to think in a critical way, to analyze any situation and could contradict or concede with a given information. These types of exercises invite rote learning which is generally discouraged in modern age.

However, books which are generally preferred at undergraduate level may be several in number. Rabbani's book among others is commonly used by the students of under-graduation classes across the country. Like the textbooks at matriculation and intermediate level, it does not break the chain of academic inertia and stagnation so far as the discipline of Pakistan Studies and ideology of Pakistan is concerned. Interestingly, over the years, hardly any change is found in the contents of the book. The book was published in 1989 for the first time while its latest edition which the researcher could find, is published in 2012.⁴⁵ In its preface the writer proudly claimed that it is the fifteenth edition of the book, but it is more or less the same as the 1989 edition of the book which is immensely disheartening. In thirty-two years, we have not been able to change the narrative or style of writing, update the information, and replace mythology by reality. The small changes observed are only to extend the old narrative and there has been no changes in the basic pattern. Hence, it means that since long the educational policies have also remained unchanged which cater the same old books up till now. In the initial chapter, on the conceptualization of ideology, the writer mentions:

The French philosopher Autoine Destull de Tracy defined it as science of ideas ... Karl Marx ideology means the ideas of ruling Junta who seeks to perpetuate the prevailing order of Capitalism and their own privileged position. Karl Manneheim, to some extent took a similar view

⁴² This story telling style is continued in the following pages too. There is no reference or proof of any sort attached to the text or the maps provided. M. D. Zafar, *Pakistan Studies*, p. 1.

⁴³ Readers are never told about the role of some religious personalities like Maulana Maudoodi in the Pakistan Movement, how he opposed the freedom movement under the Quaid and called him *Kafir-e-Azam*.

⁴⁴ Dr. Kaisrani, visiting faculty, International Islamic University. Islamabad. He differs here with this information and is of the view that Chaudry Rehmat Ali never coined this word. Interview. December 26, 2020.

⁴⁵ The third book selected for this study is the Pakistan Studies book commonly used at undergraduate level. The title and necessary information about the book is as follows: Ikram Rabbani, *Comprehensive Book of Pakistan Studies* (Compulsory) B. A/ B. Sc/ Medical/ Engineering/ Commerce/ C.S.S./ P.C.S./P.M.S./M.A. (Political Science) M.A. (History) M.A. (Sociology). The Caravan Book House. Lahore. 2008 (1st ed. 1989).

of ideology by defining it as the conservative, self-seeking and biased views of the dominant class in society.⁴⁶

The writer asserts that ideology of Pakistan is based on the ideals of Islamic system, and the famous slogan of Pakistan movement, “*Pakistan ka matlub kiya, La Ilaha Illallah*”⁴⁷ is the basis of Pakistan. Many reasons are given for the establishment of Pakistan. Under the sub-heading on ideology and Allama Iqbal, there is a generous manifestation of Iqbal’s verses from his Urdu poetry. The next section is about Quaid-i-Azam Muhammad Ali Jinnah and ideology of Pakistan, covering mostly his personal and political life and in the end underlines that he believed in Islamic ideology which eventually became the basis for Muslim struggle in India. At last, the academic exercises given, are monotonous which promote rote learning and not critical inquiry or analysis of the subject matter. Over a period of thirty-two years, the so-called quality of the text, contents, concepts and their explanation, and quantity of the material produced are almost the same.

Conclusion

The academic discourse about the correlation between the ideology of Pakistan and the discipline of Pakistan studies may be concluded that the earlier meaning and interpretation of the ideology of Pakistan and its inclusion in the curriculum of the aforesaid discipline is stood either on ontological foundations or beneath the canopy of law of necessity. The newly established nation-state needed immediate settlement of its multiple issues. The state-centric intelligentsia momentarily set aside the common sentiments and general requirements of multi-colour Pakistani society and begun their struggle to shelter all the problems under the umbrella of religion-oriented ideology. However, an in-depth know-how and insight regarding the term ideology in general and Pakistani ideology in specific perspective remained outside the academic debate and discussion. Our national ideology was developed under the shadow of religion in the initial phase of our freedom with repercussions on the coming eras as well. Pakistan Studies was envisaged to be the best suited means to transmit the ideology of Pakistan at academic level. The discipline was made compulsory at all levels of education in the country. Its curriculum development passed through zigzags in different periods of history but ultimately proceeded in a specific direction having strong influence of religion or belief system with very less room open for reason and rationality. Its teaching at school and college level while both teaching and research at university level is a big manifestation of becoming a full-fledged discipline across the country. The ‘ideology of Pakistan’ and the term ‘ideology’ have been studied and understood under the primordial and modern approaches respectively. Though the former approach prevailed for a longer period of time, but the later approach was kept on the back burner. When the state faced a troublesome incident in 1971, some of the intellectual corners thereafter felt a dire need to revisit our past and highlight our errors, mistakes and blunders. During the prolonged tension between the two wings of Pakistan, the ideology of Pakistan was put to test and a mega question-mark was labelled on the ‘two nation theory’. This bitter chapter is a permanent part of our political history which cannot be negated and ignored even in the days to come. The curriculum of Pakistan studies which is still being taught in all the educational institutions of our country have either little, insufficient or distorted information and data regarding such acrimonious experiences of the past. Unless and until the cause and effect of any phenomenon is properly perceived, proceeding towards rightful direction and finding out a correct destination might be a dream but not reality. Hence, the correlation between the ideology of Pakistan and the discipline of Pakistan Studies should be cross-checked and perceived afresh. The curriculum development of this important discipline should be revisited and updated not only in the light of original historical records, diaries, speeches and statements of the dignitaries and top-class leadership but also beneath the light of dialecticism and scientific method. It goes without saying that Pakistan Studies previously considered as a conventional and traditional subject has now travelled long and got space in the fold of social sciences. Now being an integral part of social sciences, Pakistan Studies and its curriculum development should be subservient to the scientific method, objectivity, unbiasedness, impartiality, and not to myths, value judgment, individual or cluster like and dislike.

Bibliography

⁴⁶ The first chapter is on Pakistan Ideology on the same pattern as in books of other levels. First the definition and examples of ideology are given, from various writings of western philosophers. Ikram Rabbani, *Comprehensive Book of Pakistan Studies*. Lahore: Caravan Book House, 2008.

⁴⁷ This is the popular slogan reproduced almost in the key books of Pakistan Studies. This Urdu slogan translation in English goes as “what is the meaning of Pakistan, there is no other god than Allah”.

- Asaf Hussain, *Elite Politics in An Ideological State: The Case for Pakistan*, (England: Wm Dawson and Sons Ltd, Cannon House, Folkestone, Kent, 1979)
- Askari Rizvi, *The Military and Politics in Pakistan, 1977-1986*, (Lahore: Progressive Publishers, 1996)
- Ayesha Siddiq, *Military Inc.: Inside Pakistan's Military Economy*, (London: Pluto Press, 2017)
- Ghulam Qasim Khan Marwat, "Science and Religion: From Conflict to Conversation" in *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, Vol. XXIX, No.1 (2008)
- Government of Pakistan, *The National Assembly of Pakistan Debates, Official Report* (Karachi: Manager Publications, n.d.), Vol. 1, No. 5, 5 March 1976. Also see Jaffar Ahmed, "Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject" in Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir eds. *Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2009)
 - http://www.pakistani.org/pakistan/legislation/constituent_address_11aug1947.html, accessed on 23 September 2021.
- Jack Hayward, Brian Barry and Archie Brown, eds. *The British Study of Politics in the Twentieth Century*, (London: Oxford University Press, 2003)
- Jaffar Ahmed, "Pakistan Studies: A Subject of the State and the State of the Subject" in Inayatullah, Rubina Saigol and Pervez Tahir eds. *Social Sciences in Pakistan: A Profile*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2009), p. 310.
- Masood Akhtar Zahid, "Dictatorship in Pakistan: A Study of the Zia Era (1977-88)" in *Pakistan Journal of History and Culture*, Vol XXXII, No. 1 (2011)
- Mr. Jinnah's Presidential Address to the Constituent Assembly of Pakistan, August 11, 1947
- Murat Bayar, "Reconsidering Primordialism: An Alternative Approach to the Study of Ethnicity", in *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 32.9, (2009)
- Naureen Durrani, "Pakistan: Curriculum and Construction of National Identity", in Colin Brock and , Mah-E-Rukh eds. *Education in West Central Asia. Education Around the World*. (London: Bloomsbury Academic, 2013)
- Pervez Amirali Hoodbhoy and Abdul Hameed Nayyar, "Rewriting the History of Pakistan" in Mohammad Asghar Khan ed. *Islam, politics, and the State: the Pakistan Experience*, London: Zed Books, 1985, <http://www.sacw.net/HateEducation/1985HoodbhoyNayyar06022005.html> accessed on 23 September 2021.
- Pervez Hoodbhoy, "*Jinnah and the Islamic State: Setting the Record Straight*" in *Economic and Political Weekly*, Vol. 42, No. 32 (Aug. 11-17, 2007), pp. 3300-3303.
- *Quaid-i-Azam Mohammad Ali Jinnah Speeches and Statements As Governor General of Pakistan 1947 – 48*, (Islamabad: Services Book Club, Government of Pakistan, 1989)
- Rubina Saigol, "Enemies within and Enemies Without: The Besieged Self in Pakistani Textbooks", i in *Futures* 37, Issue 9, November 2005)
- Rubina Saigol, *Becoming a Modern Nation: Educational Discourse in the Early Years of Ayub Khan (1958-1964)*, (Islamabad: Council of Social Sciences, 2003)
- Rubina Saigol, *Knowledge and Identity: Articulation of Gender in Educational Discourse in Pakistan*, (Lahore: ASR Publications, 1995)
- Saeeduddin Ahmad Dar and Sarfaraz Hussain Ansari. "Pakistan Studies; A Report on the State of the Discipline in Pakistan". N.I.P.S, Report No. 1. Quaid-i-Azam University. 1988
- Seyma Bilgen, "Differences Between Primordialist and Modernist Approaches To Nationalism" https://www.academia.edu/43177252/DIFFERENCES_BETWEEN_PRIMORDIALIST_AND_MODERNIST_APPROACHES_TO_NATIONALISM accessed on 22 September 2021.
- Tanveer Khalid, Phd Thesis, *Islamization in Pakistan: A Political And Constitutional Study From 1947 – 1988*. Karachi University. (2004)
- *The Eastern Times*, Lahore, 02 December 1947.
- The Pakistan Study Centres Act, 1976 (ACT No. XXVII OF 1976)
- V. Y. Belokrenitsky and V. N. Moskalenko, *A Political History of Pakistan 1947-2007*, OUP, 2013.